

PLANNING AND TRANSPORTATION COMMITTEE

Monday, 1 December 2014

Minutes of the meeting of the Planning and Transportation Committee held at the Guildhall EC2 at 10.00 am

Present

Members:

Deputy Michael Welbank (Chairman)	Marianne Fredericks
Oliver Lodge (Deputy Chairman)	Gregory Jones QC
Randall Anderson	Deputy Henry Jones
David Bradshaw	Paul Martinelli
Deputy John Chapman	Deputy Alastair Moss
Dennis Cotgrove	Sylvia Moys
Revd Dr Martin Dudley	Graham Packham
Emma Edhem	Angela Starling
Alderman Peter Estlin	

Officers:

Peter Lisle	Assistant Town Clerk
Katie Odling	Town Clerk's Department
Simon Owen	Chamberlain's Department
Deborah Cluett	Comptroller and City Solicitor's Department
Emily Rimington	Trainee Solicitor
Philip Everett	Director of the Built Environment
Annie Hampson	Department of the Built Environment
Paul Beckett	Department of the Built Environment
Ted Rayment	Department of the Built Environment
Paul Monaghan	Department of the Built Environment
Alison Hurley	City Surveyor's Department
Alan Rickwood	City Police

1. **APOLOGIES**

Apologies for absence were received from Sophie Fernandes, George Gillon, Brian Harris, Brian Mooney, Alderman Neil Redcliffe, Tom Sleigh and Patrick Streeter.

2. **MEMBERS' DECLARATIONS UNDER THE CODE OF CONDUCT IN RESPECT OF ITEMS ON THE AGENDA**

3. **MINUTES**

RESOLVED - That the Minutes of the meeting held on 11 November 2014 be approved.

4. **TOWN PLANNING AND DEVELOPMENT APPLICATIONS**

The Committee received a report of the Chief Planning Officer and Development Director relative to development and advertisement application dealt with under delegated authority since the previous meeting.

5. **VALID PLANNING APPLICATIONS RECEIVED BY DEPARTMENT OF THE BUILT ENVIRONMENT**

The Committee received a report of the Chief Planning Officer and Development Director which provided details of valid planning applications received by the Department.

6. **REPORTS OF THE CITY PLANNING OFFICER RELATIVE TO PLANNING APPLICATIONS**

6.1 **160 Aldersgate Street, EC1A 4DD**

Registered Plan No.: 14/00878/FULMAJ

Proposal: Refurbishment and extension of the existing office building including (i) the construction of an additional storey (incorporating plant) (ii) reconstruction of the facade on Aldersgate Street (iii) provision of retail floorspace (Class A1) at ground floor level (84sq.m.) (iv) provision of roof terraces at 7th and 8th floor levels (v) installation of an additional access point at the rear of the building, and (vi) associated internal and external alterations (total increase in floorspace 1,913sq.m.).

The Chief Planning Officer and Development Director detailed site and surrounding information to Members.

Robert Barker, Gillie Bexson, Averil Baldwin, Alpesh Lad and Ann Holmes spoke against the application and Martin Claisse, Tim Fyles and Sam Hine spoke in favour of the application.

During the discussion, amongst several points particular reference was made to the following –

- The impact of the increase in height and bulk at roof level on the daylight and sunlight hours and amenity of surrounding residential properties, and sunlight/daylight to the play area adjacent to Seddon House. Some Members expressed concern notwithstanding that the Daylight and Sunlight Report submitted with the application stated that as a result of the proposed development, all windows within the surrounding residential properties would meet the Building Research Establishment (BRE) good practice guidelines for daylight and sunlight; and that the Light Pollution and Amenity Report submitted during the application process stated that the proposals would result in no change to the sunlight condition to the play area adjacent to Seddon House.
- Members discussed the proposal for the creation of roof terraces on the 7th and 8th floor levels and expressed concern regarding noise

nuisance and it was considered that this would have a detrimental impact on residential amenity.

Upon being put to the vote, planning permission was refused –

Vote: 1 in favour, 13 against, 2 abstentions.

RESOLVED – That planning permission be refused because of adverse impacts of the development on residential amenity, and that the Chief Planning Officer be delegated authority to prepare the formal reason for refusal to reflect the Committee's decision.

NOTE: THE REASON FOR REFUSAL CONTAINED IN THE DECISION WHICH WAS ISSUED ON FRIDAY, 5TH DECEMBER LETTER WAS AS FOLLOWS:

The proposed alteration and extension of the building which includes an increase in bulk and height, and the formation of accessible terraces would lead to a diminution of residential amenity to nearby residential occupiers contrary to Core Strategy CS21 and Draft Local Plan Policy DM 21.3

6.2 Farringdon East Crossrail Oversight Development

Proposal: Ground plus five storey over site development at Farringdon East Station, comprising office (B1) (11,211sq.m) with associated cycle parking, servicing, storage and plant and use of void space within the station infrastructure fronting onto Lindsey Street, Charterhouse Square and Hayne Street for retail use (Use Classes A1-A5), (286sq.m) office entrance and servicing.

The Chief Planning Officer and Development Director detailed site and surrounding information to Members.

Charlie Hobson and Mike Fox spoke against the application and Daniel Moore spoke in favour of the application.

The Committee supported the principle of the application, however expressed some concerns regarding the office entrance on Lindsey Street. Members noted that due to the site constraints there was room for only the office entrance lobby at ground floor level and the remainder of the office floor space would be located on the upper floors.

Concerns were expressed regarding the bulk and scale of the development, the design of the development, light spillage from it and its impact on the adjoining conservation areas and listed buildings, particularly related to Charterhouse.

A motion was proposed and seconded to defer the application as it was considered that alterations could make the scheme acceptable.

RESOLVED – That the application for planning permission be deferred to a future meeting to address concerns in relation to the office entrance , the bulk and scale of the development, light spillage and impact on adjoining conservation areas and listed buildings.

6.3 **6 Carmelite Street EC4Y 0BS**

Registered Plan No.: 14/00998/FULL

Proposal: Installation of new accessible entrance doors and glazed surround on the Tallis Street elevation of the building in association with the public house (Use Class A4) (public house use approved under planning permission dated 11.04.2000, ref: 5203N).

The Chief Planning Officer and Development Director detailed site and surrounding information to Members.

In considering the application, a motion was proposed and seconded to include conditions which addressed the following points –

- the proposed entrance doors should be used for ingress and egress purposes only whilst the premises were in operation and should be kept closed at all other times.
- the proposed entrance doors must be fitted with opening and self-closing mechanisms.
- The entrance lobby should not be used for any activities associated with the Class A4 use other than for access purposes and for entering or leaving the premises.

RESOLVED – That planning permission be granted for the proposal in accordance with the attached schedule, subject to the inclusion of additional conditions to address the points made as follows –

- the proposed entrance doors shall be used for ingress and egress purposes only whilst the premises were in operation and shall be kept closed at all other times.
- the proposed entrance doors must be fitted with opening and self-closing mechanisms.
- The entrance lobby shown on drawing number 1135-12-010G shall not be used for any activities associated with the Class A4 use other than for access purposes and for entering or leaving the premises.

6.4 **14 - 17 Carthusian Street EC1M 6AD**

This application was deferred pending further information.

6.5 **Bevis Marks House 24 Bevis Marks EC3A 7JB**

Registered Plan No.: 14/00433/FULMAJ

Proposal: The demolition of the existing buildings and construction of 2 basement levels and ground plus 16 storey building (89m AOD) comprising

office (Class B1) use [35,658sq.m GEA] and retail (Class A1/A3) uses [758sq.m GEA] with servicing and plant facilities. [Total 36,416sq.m GEA].

The Chief Planning Officer and Development Director detailed site and surrounding information to Members.

RESOLVED – That,

- a) Planning permission be granted for the above proposal in accordance with the details set out in the attached schedule subject to planning obligations and other agreements being entered into in respect of those matters set out in the report, the decision not to be issued until such obligations have been executed; and
- b) approval be given for Officers to negotiate and execute obligations in respect of those matters set out in the report under Section 106.

EXTENSION OF THE MEETING

At this point, the time limit for Committee meetings as set out in Standing Order No 40 had been reached, but there being a two-thirds majority of the Committee present who voted in favour of an extension, the Committee agreed to continue the meeting.

7. 2 - 6 CANNON STREET EC4M 6YH Registered Plan No.: 14/00780/FULMAJ

Proposal: The demolition of the existing building and construction of a new office building (Class B1) comprising 7 storeys plus basement and associated hard and soft landscaping, roof top plant, accessible terrace, access and servicing, ancillary cycle parking and other associated works.

The Chief Planning Officer and Development Director detailed site and surrounding information to Members.

RESOLVED – That planning permission be granted for the development referred to above in accordance with the details set out on the attached schedule subject to planning obligations and other agreements being entered into in respect of those matters set out in the report, the decision notice not to be issued until such obligations have been executed and any necessary agreements and stopping up of the highway under Section 278 of the Highway Act 1980. In the event any necessary consents or agreements are not forthcoming then the matter will be referred back to the Planning and Transportation for consideration.

8. AMENDMENT TO THE SCHEME OF DELEGATION

This item was deferred to a Special Meeting of the Planning and Transportation Committee on 15 December 2014.

9. CITY OF LONDON LOCAL PLAN: ADOPTION

This item was deferred to a Special Meeting of the Planning and Transportation Committee on 15 December 2014.

10. **REVENUE AND CAPITAL BUDGETS - 2015/16**
This item was deferred to a Special Meeting of the Planning and Transportation Committee on 15 December 2014.
11. **ANNUAL ON-STREET PARKING ACCOUNTS 2013/14 AND UTILISATION OF ACCRUED SURPLUS ON HIGHWAY IMPROVEMENTS AND SCHEMES**
This item was deferred to a Special Meeting of the Planning and Transportation Committee on 15 December 2014.
12. **CITY FUND SURPLUS HIGHWAY - BARTS SQUARE, EC1**
This item was deferred to a Special Meeting of the Planning and Transportation Committee on 15 December 2014.
13. **RESOLUTION FROM THE POLICE COMMITTEE**
This item was deferred to a Special Meeting of the Planning and Transportation Committee on 15 December 2014.
14. **DEBT ARREARS**
This item was deferred to a Special Meeting of the Planning and Transportation Committee on 15 December 2014.
15. **DELEGATION OF ADDITIONAL POWERS TO LONDON COUNCILS TRANSPORT & ENVIRONMENT COMMITTEE - DELIVERY OF THE PARKING ON PRIVATE LAND APPEALS SERVICE**
This item was deferred to a Special Meeting of the Planning and Transportation Committee on 15 December 2014.
16. **FARRINGDON STREET BRIDGE - GATEWAY 7 FINAL**
This item would be dealt with under Urgency procedures as a decision was required by 1 December 2014.

The meeting closed at 12.25 pm

Chairman

Contact Officer: Katie Odling
tel. no.: 020 7332 3414
katie.odling@cityoflondon.gov.uk